

Katherine Beinkafner, PhD, CPG of Mid-Hudson Geosciences (February 14, 2010) Review of

Seven Peaks at Mountain Road,

Draft Environmental Impact Statement

Town of Mamakating, Sullivan County, NY

Dated January 22, 2010, prepared by The Chazen Companies

Major Problem with Boundaries of Archeological Survey

The archeological survey report shows that the survey was completed in an area offset to the southwest of the actual site. In Appendix H a comparison of Figures 2 and 5 indicates that the archeological work cut off about 800 feet on the northeast (resort) side of the project and added about 800 feet on the southwest side of the project. Consequently, the resort area and the two areas labeled "reserved for future single family" were possibly not included in the survey. Also a section along the southeastern boundary was not included in the survey. This error brings into question the relative locations of the seven pre-historic (pre-contact) and the farmstead and hunting camp. Are the locations of those finds correct with respect to the topography or the boundaries of the survey? This question is significant because 6 of 7 of the prehistoric sites are recommended for inclusion on the National Register of Historic Places and also the farmstead may be appropriate to register.

It is necessary to accurately record on maps and clearly mark on the ground these site locations. The plan to avoid construction on these sites is a laudable strategy, but something cannot be protected if the bulldozer operator and the homeowner do not know the location of the prehistoric and historic sites. This confusion must be rectified before alternative site plans can be compared.